Planning Committee - 21 July 2020

Application No: 20/00332/FULL Full Application

Site: Oak Cottage, Platoff Road, Lymington, SO41 8AG

Proposal: Outbuilding; demolition of existing outbuilding

Applicant: Mr & Mrs Booth

Case Officer: Ann Braid

Parish: LYMINGTON AND PENNINGTON

1. REASON FOR COMMITTEE CONSIDERATION

Contrary to Town Council View.

2. DEVELOPMENT PLAN DESIGNATION

Listed Building Tree Preservation Order Flood Zone

3. PRINCIPAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES

SP16 The historic and built environmentSP17 Local distinctivenessDP37 OutbuildingsDP2 General development principles

4. SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING GUIDANCE

Not applicable

5. NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK

Sec 12 - Achieving well-designed places Sec 15 - Conserving and enhancing the natural environment Sec 16 - Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

6. MEMBER COMMENTS

None received

7. PARISH COUNCIL COMMENTS

Lymington & Pennington Town Council: Recommend permission for the following reasons:

- The distance between the garage and house means there is minimal impact on the setting of the listed building.
- The design of the garage is appropriate.
- Previous applications have been withdrawn and not refused, as stated in the Conservation Officer's report.

8. CONSULTEES

- 8.1 Tree Officer: No objection subject to condition
- 8.2 Building Design & Conservation Area Officer: Objection on the grounds of impact on the setting of the listed building

9. **REPRESENTATIONS**

9.1 None received

10. RELEVANT HISTORY

- 10.1 Detached garage with storage (18/00655) withdrawn on 8 October 2018
- 10.2 Detached garage with storage over (17/00978) withdrawn on 18 December 2017

11. ASSESSMENT

- 11.1 Oak Cottage is a grade II listed cottage located at the southern end of Platoff Road. It is set, facing the road with a long linear garden to the southern side. To the rear of the house are open fields, edged with mature boundary Oak trees. To the northern side of the house is a single garage and there is an existing shed in the southern garden.
- 11.2 Consent is sought for a garage to be located at the southern end of the garden, where an access has been opened up to the road. The building would be 21.2 square metres in floor area and would have a ridge height of 4.1 metres. It would be built in timber with a reclaimed clay tiled roof and would provide parking space for a single car as well as a workbench and storage area. The building would be accessed through an opening in the hedge, with a 5-bar gate. The garage would be fitted with timber doors and casement window, and steel or zinc rainwater goods. The issues to assess are the impact of the proposed building on the setting of the listed building and the character and appearance of the locality.
- 11.3 This is the third application for an outbuilding in this location, the previous two having been withdrawn following objections on conservation and tree protection grounds. The first application (reference 17/00978) was for a building of 28 square metres floor area and a ridge height of 5.14 metres. The second (18/00655) was for a building of 21 square metres floor area and a 3.5 metre

ridge height. In each case it was identified that the visual impact of a building in the proposed location would be unacceptable.

- 11.4 Policy DP37 of the New Forest National Park Local Plan 2016-2036 (August 2019) relates to domestic outbuildings and states that they will be permitted where they are proportionate and clearly subservient to the dwelling they are to serve in terms of their design, scale, size, height and massing. In this case the existing cottage is of particularly modest proportions and the chosen location is the narrowest part of the garden, which would result in the garage appearing cramped and more dominant both in the street scene and in comparison with the cottage. For these reasons the outbuilding would be contrary to Policy DP37.
- 11.5 Policy SP16 states that proposals should protect, maintain or enhance important sites and features of the historic environment. In particular, proposals will be supported where they do not harm the significance of a listed building and where they make a positive contribution to its setting. The key view of Oak Cottage is from the south across the small area of green at which Platoff Road, Lower Woodside Road and Ridgeway Lane meet. From this direction, views of the southern gable are somewhat restricted as the building is partially obscured by trees, nevertheless the property's ornate bargeboards, tall chimneys and tile hanging are striking and character features that draw the eye and are discernible through the vegetation, which frames the view of the cottage. The effect of the tree screening is also seasonal. A building of the size proposed in this location would dominate the approach and lead to the blocking of the view with a solid building which would dominate the historic cottage and appear completely out of scale. The proposal would therefore be contrary to Policy SP16 of the Local Plan, as it would be detrimental to the setting of the listed building and contrary to Policy SP17, as the dominant form of the building would erode the existing character of this part of the National Park.
- 11.6 In assessing proposals affecting listed buildings the Authority is required to have regard to Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended), whereby, in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. Furthermore, paragraph 192 of the National Planning Policy Framework states that in determining planning applications, local planning authorities should take account of the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness. The Framework goes on to state, in Paragraph 194, that:

"Any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage

asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), should require clear and convincing justification."

There is space to the north of the dwelling that has been used for the parking of vehicles. This remains the preferred option and there is no overriding justification for the proposed building, that would outweigh the harm, identified above, that would be caused by this development.

- 11.7 The site is constrained by the trees along the rear boundary of the site which are protected by a Tree Preservation Order. The Tree Officer has assessed the proposal and considers that provided the recommendations of the submitted tree report are followed the proposal would be acceptable in terms of impacts on the protected trees, and would therefore be in accordance with Policy SP6 of the Local Plan.
- 11.8 In conclusion, an outbuilding of the proposed size, in the chosen location, would result in a dominant form of development which would be out of scale both in the locality and in comparison with the listed host dwelling. The listed building makes a particularly valuable contribution to the character of the locality when viewed from the south and the proposed outbuilding would dominate this view and have a harmful impact on the setting the listed building. The proposal would therefore be contrary to Local and National policy and guidance.

12. **RECOMMENDATION**

Refuse

Reason(s)

1 An outbuilding of the proposed size, in the chosen location, would result in a dominant form of development which would be out of scale both in the locality and in comparison with the listed host dwelling and would have a harmful impact on the setting of the listed building. The development would be contrary to Policies SP16, SP17, DP2 and DP37 of the New Forest National Park Local Plan 2016-2036 (August 2019) and to the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended) and the National Planning Policy Framework.

