Application No: 17/00840/FULL Full Application

Site: Lloyds TSB, Sway Road, Brockenhurst, SO42 7ZH

- **Proposal:** Change of Use to 5no. 2 bedroom flats; 4no. rooflights; 1no. new dwelling; 2 metre high brick wall; alterations to existing access; 9no. parking spaces; associated landscaping and works
- Applicant: Mr M Guterman, STANTHORNE Ltd

Case Officer: Natalie Walter

Parish: BROCKENHURST

1. REASON FOR COMMITTEE CONSIDERATION

Contrary to Parish Council view

2. DEVELOPMENT PLAN DESIGNATION

Conservation Area Defined New Forest Village Tree Preservation Order

3. PRINCIPAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES

CP1 Nature Conservation Sites of International Importance CP7 The Built Environment CP8 Local Distinctiveness CP9 Defined Villages CP12 New Residential Development CP15 Existing Employment Sites DP1 General Development Principles DP6 Design Principles DP9 Residential Density in the Defined Villages DP15 Infrastructure Provision and Developer Contributions

4. SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING GUIDANCE

Design Guide SPD Development Standards SPD

5. NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY FRAMEWORK

- Sec 3 Supporting a prosperous rural economy
- Sec 6 Delivering a wide choice of high quality homes

Sec 7 - Requiring good design

Sec 11 - Conserving and enhancing the natural environment

Sec 12 - Conserving and enhancing the historic environment

6. MEMBER COMMENTS

None received

7. PARISH COUNCIL COMMENTS

Brockenhurst Parish Council: Support this application. Recognise that this development will add to parking pressures and congestion in this area of the Village and note that the change of use to residential will result in the loss of an employment site. That said, the property has been vacant for more than 18 months during which time no viable alternative has emerged and it is the Council's view that this development will help to meet the Village's pressing need for smaller housing units.

8. CONSULTEES

- 8.1 Tree Officer: No objection subject to conditions.
- 8.2 Building Design & Conservation Area Officer: Objection. Lack of justification for alterations to existing building and proposed additional unit within car park. Intensity of proposed use places undue pressure on the building which will have an adverse impact on the non-designated heritage asset. Design of new dwelling does not respond well to its context or architectural setting. Resultant adverse impact on character of conservation area.
- 8.3 Highway Authority (HCC): No objection.
- 8.4 Ecologist: Support subject to condition securing mitigation measures.
- 8.5 Planning Policy Officer: Objection. Whilst there is an identified housing need in the National Park and the proposal would contribute to meeting some of this local need in a sustainable, brownfield location, objection to the loss of commercial use on the site and the change to a wholly residential scheme. If repeated in other settlements in the National Park, there would be an impact on the socio-economic well-being of local communities in the National Park, contrary to the Authority's socio-economic duty.

9. **REPRESENTATIONS**

- 9.1 Three letters of support received:
 - The proposal is sympathetic to local surroundings;
 - The size of dwellings is suitable and will add to the diversity of housing in Brockenhurst;
 - The development will be a positive improvement to the village.
- 9.2 Four representations received objecting to the proposal for the following reasons:
 - Overdevelopment of site;
 - Brick wall to rear (natural screening preferred);

- Insufficient level of car parking;
- Impact on parking on Sway Road;
- Boundary treatment with 1 Sway Road;
- Surface water drainage;
- Impact on light and privacy of 1 Sway Road.
- 9.3 One letter of comment raising concern about the level of on-site parking provision.
- 9.4 The Friends of Brockenhurst object to the application for the following reasons:
 - Insufficient parking;
 - Insufficient space for new dwelling on site;
 - Slight reduction in grazing likely due to widening of access;
 - Lack of detail about fence.

10. RELEVANT HISTORY

10.1 Change of use to dental practice (Use Class D1); 2 no. flats (C3); Internal alterations (17/00036) granted on 21 March 2017.

11. ASSESSMENT

- 11.1 The application site is a vacant commercial premises situated within the defined village of Brockenhurst. The application site lies partially within the Conservation Area: the area of car parking and garage at the rear of the property are located outside of the Conservation Area. The building is not listed but it has been identified within the Conservation Area Character Appraisal as a building of vernacular/ local historic interest.
- 11.2 Consent was granted in March 2017 for the use of the ground floor as a dental practice (Use Class D1) and the conversion of the former office space on the first and second floors into two residential units. To date, this permission has not been implemented.
- 11.3 The current application proposes the conversion of the bank building into five two-bed flats and the construction of a three-bed dwelling in the rear part of the car park.
- 11.4 The key issues to be considered are:
 - The principle of the proposed development;
 - Whether the use would be appropriate to the existing building;
 - The design and scale of the three-bed dwelling;
 - The impact on neighbouring amenity;
 - The impact on trees and ecology;
 - Car parking and highway implications; and
 - Financial contributions.

Principle of Development

- 11.5 The site is located within the defined village boundary of Brockenhurst. Policy CP9 supports small-scale development proposals to meet local needs, including housing and employment, within defined villages. There is an identified housing need in the National Park and the proposal would contribute to meeting some of this need on a previously developed site in a sustainable location. The provision of smaller units within the centre of the village is also supported.
- 11.6 The adopted Core Strategy also supports the retention of existing facilities and seeks to prevent their loss or redevelopment: Policy CP10 seeks the retention of existing community facilities and Policy CP15 supports the retention of existing employment uses. Emerging Policy SP43 supports the retention of existing employment uses but also considers mixed use development could be appropriate on these sites in particular circumstances. The premises are currently vacant and the applicant has submitted evidence of marketing of the property [over a period of 18 months following the closure of the bank]. However, it is noted that there is an extant permission for a mixed-use scheme on the site and a policy objection has been received on the basis of precedent and impact on the socio-economic well-being of communities in the National Park.

Suitability of the Proposed Use

11.7 The building is a prominent and valuable feature within the Brockenhurst Conservation Area. The previous application, which comprised the change of use to D1 use at ground floor level with two flats above, was considered to be appropriate as the proposed use would make minimal changes to the external appearance of the building. The current scheme proposes a more intensive use of the building with conversion into five flats. The scheme introduces roof lights on the western (Sway Road), eastern (rear) and southern elevations and includes removal of the large window on the northern (Brookley Road) elevation and its replacement with two smaller windows. An objection has been received from the Authority's Senior Building Design and Conservation Officer in relation to the proposed changes to the non-designated heritage asset, which are considered to have an adverse impact on the asset and the conservation area.

Design and Scale of Three-Bed Dwelling

11.8 In addition to the proposed conversion of the bank building, the current scheme introduces a three-bed dwelling (providing approximately 110 sq. m habitable floor space) within the existing car parking area, following the demolition of a small garage (approximately 21 sq. m). The proposed house is described by the applicant as being in the style of a coach house and would

comprise a 1.5-storey dwelling with a ridge height of approximately 6.1m. The house would adjoin the rear boundary of the plot and there would be a distance of approximately 8m to the property to the rear on Auckland Avenue. The design would incorporate a large weather-boarded dormer and would comprise a mix of brick and weatherboarding with a plain clay tile roof. The design takes little reference from the existing building on the site. The proposed house would dominate the rear of the plot and would infill the space around the existing building. It is considered that the design, scale and siting of the proposed three-bed dwelling would have an adverse impact on the character and appearance of the adjacent conservation area. It would therefore conflict with Policy CP7.

Impact on Neighbouring Amenity

11.9 The proposed conversion of the former bank building includes a terrace at first floor level to be used by the occupiers of flat four. As per the previously approved scheme, a 1.5m high trellis is proposed in order to protect the amenity of residents to the rear of the site on Auckland Road. A 2m high brick wall is proposed to the rear of the three-bed house and enclosing the walled garden in the southern corner of the site. Objections have been received from neighbouring residents in relation to the proposed brick wall and also from the owner of 1 Sway Road in relation to boundary treatment and loss of light and privacy following removal of the existing garage and the construction of the three-bed house with an apex window at first floor level in the south elevation. The southern elevation of the proposed three-bed house is approximately 6.5m from the side elevation of 1 Sway Road which is considered to be sufficient distance. Details of boundary treatment could be the subject of a condition.

Impact on Trees and Ecology

- 11.10 The application site is subject to a Tree Preservation Order (TPO/0017/17) which includes a single Horse Chestnut tree. The Authority's Tree Officer considers that, if the submitted tree report and tree protection plan are adhered to, the proposals will not have any significant arboricultural impact.
- 11.11 In relation to ecology, the Authority's Ecologist supports the scheme subject to securing relevant mitigation measures. The site lies within 400m of the New Forest SPA and 5.6km of the Solent SPA and in accordance with Policy CP1, additional residential and recreational impacts caused by the development will require adequate mitigation. The applicant's agent has confirmed that a Section 106 Agreement will be provided to secure these contributions.

Provision of Car Parking and Highway Implications

11.12 The application includes the provision of 6 allocated car parking spaces and 3 additional spaces for visitors. Whilst the car parking provision falls short of the adopted standard, due to the accessibility of the location, the Highway Officer considers that this deviation is acceptable. The proposed access is to be widened to 4.2m and the Highway Officer has raised no objection to the proposed access arrangements.

Financial Contributions

- 11.13 As the scheme proposes six residential units, the Authority can seek financial contributions towards off-site affordable housing and other forms of infrastructure. Contributions have been sought and the applicant has submitted a viability report in relation to the proposed contributions which will require an independent assessment. An update on this will be provided prior to consideration of the application at committee.
- 11.14 In conclusion, a case has been made for the loss of the existing commercial use, however, there is an extant permission for a mixed-use scheme on the site. The intensification of the site, comprising the conversion of the existing building into five flats, together with the provision of a three-bed dwelling is considered to comprise an overdevelopment which will have an adverse impact on the character and appearance of the Brockenhurst Conservation Area.

12. **RECOMMENDATION**

Refuse

Reason(s)

1 The proposed development by virtue of its form, scale, massing and layout, would result in an overdevelopment of the site, which would result in a cramped layout and unsympathetic alterations to a non-designated heritage asset to the detriment of the character and appearance of Brockenhurst Conservation Area and the wider area. For these reasons, the development would therefore be contrary to policies CP7, CP8, DP1, DP6 and DP9 of the New Forest National Park Core Strategy and Development Management Policies DPD (December 2010).

